

The combination of references do not make any of the independent claims obvious. Paluch is merely a general reference related to a core shell composition. There is no real description of an apparatus nor any drawing related to any apparatus for making such a core-shell composition.

Repholz is directed to a specific apparatus. It requires at least one spacer plate for managing flow. None are required or claimed in the claims of this patent application.

Still further Repholz requires a sleeve so as to shape the shell flow and form an annulus around the core tube. The sleeve is essentially parallel to the shell flow and shapes it as well as controls the flow. Additionally, the sleeve shapes and controls the flow by the size of the sleeve walls which are variable. Even more so, rotating the sleeve brings about flow of the shell discharged from the spacer passages which is substantially circumferentially uniform about the core material, see Repholz col. 3, lines 38-45, col. 4, lines 34-46, col. 11, lines 23-48, col. 13, lines 5-12.

As stated previously, the required spacer is not present in any of our claims. Neither is the passageway defined by the sleeve which is essentially parallel to the flow of the shell material and which has varying wall thickness and rotatability so as to shape the shell and control its flow. Therefore, this apparatus described in Repholz has entirely different elements for making a core shell product. None of the positive elements present in the claims of this present application are present in Repholz. The shell control flow regulator which impinges upon the shell flow and the positioning of the core inlet tube and orifice, are not made obvious by Repholz in combination with Paluch.

Whereupon applicants by their attorney respectfully request the allowance of the specification and pendant claims.

Respectfully submitted,



Martin B. Barancik
Attorney for Applicants
Colgate-Palmolive Company
909 River Road, P.O. Box 1343
Piscataway, NJ 08855-1345
T 732-878-7492
F 732-878-7660 or 7853